

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION HEARING SYNOPSIS

**WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 1, 2007** 

Regular Session

6:00 P.M.

City Hall Wing Rooms W-118 & 119

200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA

# **COMMISSION MEMBERS**

Edward Janke, AIA, Chair Patricia Colombe, Vice Chair Helene Lavelle Scott Cunningham Dana Peak Judy Stabile Eric Thacker

JOSEPH HORWEDEL, DIRECTOR DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, BUILDING AND CODE ENFORCEMENT

# **NOTE**

To arrange an accommodation under the Americans with Disabilities Act to participate in this public meeting, we ask that you call (408) 277-4576 (VOICE) or (408) 998-5299 (TTY) at least two business days before the meeting.

# **NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC**

Good evening, my name is **Ed Janke**, and I am the Chair of the Historic Landmarks Commission. On behalf of the Commission, I would like to welcome you to tonight's meeting. I will now call to order the <u>August 1, 2007</u> meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission. Please remember to turn off your cell phones and pagers.

If you want to address the Commission, fill out a speaker card (located at the technician's station), and give the completed card to the technician. Please include the agenda item number for reference.

# The procedure for public hearings is as follows:

- After the staff report, applicants may make a five-minute presentation.
- Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the proposal should prepare to come forward. After the proponents speak, anyone wishing to speak in opposition should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have two minutes*.
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Commission will then close the public hearing. The Historic Landmarks Commission will take action on the item.

# The procedure for referrals is as follows:

- Anyone wishing to speak on a referral should prepare to come forward. Each speaker will have one minute.
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Historic Landmarks Commission will comment on the referral item.

If a Commissioner would like a topic to be addressed under one of the Good and Welfare items, please contact Planning staff in advance of the Commission meeting.

An agenda and a copy of all staff reports have been placed on the table for your convenience.

# **AGENDA**

# **ORDER OF BUSINESS**

## 6:00 PM SESSION

# 1. ROLL CALL

All Present

## 2. **DEFERRALS**

Any item scheduled for hearing this evening for which deferral is being requested will be taken out of order to be heard first on the matter of deferral. If you want to change any of the deferral dates recommended or speak to the question of deferring these or any other items, you should say so at this time.

- a. The projects being considered are:
  - 1. <u>HL06-157</u>. Historic Landmark Nomination for the Queen Anne Victorian house located at 1023 Bird Avenue, on a .19-acre site in the R-1-8 Single-Family Residence zoning district.

#### **DEFERRED TO 9-5-07**

2. MA07-002. Historical Property Contract (California Mills Act contract) between the City of San Jose and the owners of the subject property. The proposed contract, which is available to owners of designated City Landmark buildings, would facilitate a property tax reassessment and partial tax relief in return for a binding agreement to rehabilitate and maintain the historical and architectural character of the property for at least a ten-year period (Keith and Pamela Shukait, Owners). Council District: 6. SNI: None. CEQA: Exempt.

**DEFERRED TO 9-5-07** 

The matter of deferrals is now closed.

#### 3. CONSENT CALENDAR

#### NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

The consent calendar items are considered to be routine and will be adopted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a request is made by a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, staff or the public to have an item removed from the consent calendar and considered separately. If anyone in the audience wishes to speak on one of these items, please make your request at this time.

- a. APPROVAL OF THE JULY 11, 2007 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION SYNOPSIS. Noted that the HLC requested input to the Director re: use of developer funds under the report on the Lowe's rezoning.
- b. The Addition of the following Qualifying Properties to the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory:
  - 1. The Addition of the Bonsai Nursery building, located at <u>966 South De Anza Boulevard</u>, to the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory. Council District: 1. SNI: None. CEQA: Exempt.
  - 2. The Addition of the residence located at <u>1566 Duckett Way</u>, to the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory. Council District: 1. SNI: None. CEQA: Exempt.

#### **Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission to adopt a Resolution approving the addition of the Qualifying Properties to the City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory as Structures of Merit.

Consultant Eric Schoenauer spoke on behalf of the developer of the Duckett Way property, noting they were pleased to be able to preserve the historic house as part of the project.

Approved 7-0-0

The Consent Calendar is now closed.

#### 4. PUBLIC HEARINGS

a. <u>HP07-003</u>. Historic Preservation Permit to allow construction of an approximately 750-square-foot, two-story addition and detached garage on a 0.12-acre contributing single-family residential site (183 Sonoma Street) in the Lakehouse City Landmark Historic District (Lynn Barringer, Owner). Council District: 3. SNI: Delmas Park. CEQA: Exempt. (Plans)

#### **Staff Recommendation:**

Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposed work conforms to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval to the Director of Planning.

Commissioner Cunningham stated that the large hip roof on the porte cochere, the concrete shingles, the style of the entry door, stucco siding and gabled dormers were inconsistent with the craftsman bungalow architecture.

Vice Chair Colombe stated that: the (n) replacement window to the south of the front door looks narrower than the (e) window opening; the brick around the base and concrete shake shingles are inconsistent with craftsman architecture; a composition or thinner concrete shingle would be more consistent; and asked for clarification that the (e) shed dormer is decorative.

Commissioner Peak thanked the owner for working to preserve the house and asked for clarification about existing fabric such as windows, porch posts and railings. She further stated that: the orientation of the garage ridge line should be changed; wood siding would be more appropriate than stucco; porch details are inconsistent with craftsman style; brick cladding is unnecessary if not existing; and agreed with Commissioner Cunningham that the rear elevation should be simplified.

Commissioner Lavelle noted that the home is not in good repair with mostly missing features and Commissioners seem to be asking the owner to build a vision of a craftsman home. Are we asking the owner to start over?

Chair Janke stated that given the owner has no documentation of what existed and understanding the historic context and methods of construction, the hip roof on the porte cochere, the rear gable roofed dormers, the stucco, brick, and concrete shingles did not belong on this house. He did not believe the house should be added onto in this way.

A MOTION WAS MADE TO REFER THE PROJECT TO THE DRC FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION AND CONTINUE THE ITEM TO THE SEPTEMBER MEETING BEFORE FORWARDING COMMENT AND RECOMMENDATION TO THE DIRECTOR. MOTION APPROVED (6-1-0), COLOMBE OPPOSED)

# 5. REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS OR OTHER AGENCIES

a. Report from the Secretary regarding revisions to the Historic Report for Planned Development Rezoning <a href="PDC06-094">PDC06-094</a> on a 4.4 gross acre site located at the southwest corner of Stockton Avenue and Cinnabar Street, to allow the development of up to 250 single-family attached residential units. The proposed Rezoning would allow for the demolition of 11 industrial buildings on the subject site.

The Commission reviewed the Historic Report during the Mitigated Negative Declaration circulation period at their July 11, 2007 meeting. Akoni Danielsen, Principal Environmental Planner, reported that new information was submitted during the Mitigated Negative Declaration circulation period re: the Gas Station and the commercial building at 355 Stockton. The historical consultant is researching the new information and evaluating potential impacts to cultural resources.

# 6. PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Public comments to the Historic Landmarks Commission on non-agendized items. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to two minutes. The Commission cannot take any formal action without the item being properly noticed and placed on an agenda. In response to public comment, the Historic Landmarks Commission is limited to the following options:

- i. Responding to statements made or questions posed by members of the public; or
- ii. Requesting staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or
- iii. Directing staff to place the item on a future agenda.
  - a. Public Comment.

# 7. GOOD AND WELFARE

- a. Report from the Redevelopment Agency
- b. Report from the Secretary
  - i) Status of Circulation of Environmental Review Documents http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/eir/
    - Parkview Towers SDEIR
       (bounded by E. St. John, N. First, Devine, and N. Second Streets)

       NOP distributed March 2006
       Circulation anticipated June 2007
    - Coyote Valley Specific Plan (CVSP) DEIR Circulation Period ended June 29, 2007
    - The Carlysle mixed-use high-rise (H07-008) (bounded by W. St. John St., N. Almaden Ave, Carlysle St., & Notre Dame St.) Initial Study Pending

      The shade and shadow study technical report will be circulated to the Commission with the environmental clearance document.
    - Coleman Avenue/Autumn Street Improvement Project ADEIR NOP distributed March 2007 Scoping Meeting held April 17, 2007
    - San Jose Medical Center Demolition NOP distributed July 2007 Scoping Meeting held August 9, 2007

ii) Status of HLC Recommendations on Referrals to City Council, Boards, Commissions, and Other Agencies:

# **Martha Gardens Conservation Area**

May 16, 2007 PC Recommended Approval August 14, 2007 City Council Hearing

The City Council Designation Consideration was deferred in order to respond to property owner concerns. Planning Staff will provide a Supplemental Council Memo prior to the August 14, 2007 Council Hearing.

# Flea Market DEIR (File No. GP06-04-01/PDC03-108)

April 24, 2007 EIR Certification Upheld, GP Amendment Approved. July 18, 2007 Rezoning: Planning Commission Recommended Approval. August 14, 2007 Rezoning: City Council Hearing (<u>CC Memo</u>)

# Ballpark Study in the Diridon/Arena Area

Vice Chair Colombe, HLC Representative February 28, 2007 Planning Commission Certified EIR September 5, 2007 HLC: HRI additions anticipated.

PDC06-100. Planned Development Rezoning - 744 Morse St. Relocation PD Rezoning and PD Permit for relocation approved. PD Permit for new construction to be referred to HLC DRC.

- iii) Fall 2007 Historic Landmarks Commission Retreat Tentative Date: Friday, November 2, 2007, 12:00 – 4:30 p.m. *Date confirmed*.
- iv) Donner-Houghton House City Landmark Fire

HPO Zarnowitz reported on the status of the Historic Landmark, referring to a City Council Memo. The Building Official will require demolition because the building remains create a public safety hazard. The owner has offered to work with the City to photograph, label and store façade sections on-site in a dry, secure place, and offer for relocation and/or salvage.

Commissioner Stabile voiced concern about people entering the vacant property illegally and asked what can be done to require owners to secure property.

Deputy City Attorney Renee Gurza clarified that the City has ordinances addressing vacant and neglected houses. Akoni Danielsen noted that Code Enforcement had been working with the owner to require protection, and that this event may raise the question as to what more can be done to protect vacant historic resources.

# c. Report from Committees

History San Jose Collections Committee
 Commissioner Stabile, Liaison
 The committee will meet on August 8<sup>th</sup> in preparation for more de-accessioning.

- Coyote Valley Specific Plan and Habitat Conservation Plan Advisory Committee Commissioner Cunningham, Liaison No Report.
- Japantown Survey Committee

Commissioner Lavelle, Liaison

June 19, 2007 Community Meeting, Northside Community Center Intensive Level Survey: City Council Acceptance anticipated September 2007. Commissioner Lavelle reported that the community meeting went well, and noted further that had the property owners attended tonight's meeting re: an addition to a single family house in a Historic District, they may have been alarmed by the process.

- Pellier Park Committee
   Commissioner Colombe, Liaison
   Commission requested a status update on the park reconstruction.
- City of San Jose BART extension, Design, Art & Architecture Review Chair Janke, Liaison No Report.

# d. Report from Historic Landmarks Commission Subcommittees

Design Review Committee (DRC) (<u>synopsis</u>)
 Commissioners Janke, Colombe and Cunningham, members
 July 18, 2007 Report

# 8. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

Meeting adjourned in memory of founding environmental conservationist and preservationist Mel Lane (1922-July 28, 2007).

# 2007 HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE

DATE	TIME	TYPE OF MEETING	LOCATION
No Meeting in January January 17, 2007 January 26, 2007	12:00 p.m. 12:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee m. HLC Retreat	Room T-550 Room T-1654
February 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Special Meeting/DRC Subcommittee	Room W118/119
February 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.		ee Room T-550
March 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Special Meeting	Room W118/119
March 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
April 4, 2007	5:00 p.m.	Special Session	Room T-332
April 4, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
April 18, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	No Meeting
May 2, 2007	5:30 p.m.	Regular Meeting (Early Start Time) Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
May 16, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
June 6, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
June 20, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
July 11, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W120
July 18, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
August 1, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
August 15, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
September 5, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting	Room W118/119
September 19, 2007	12:00 p.m.	Design Review Subcommittee	Room T-550
October 3, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
October 17, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
November 7, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
November 21, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550
December 5, 2007	6:00 p.m.	Regular Meeting Design Review Subcommittee	Room W118/119
December 19, 2007	12:00 p.m.		Room T-550

HISTORIC LANDMARKS AGENDA ON THE WEB: <a href="http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/hearings/historic.asp">http://www.sanjoseca.gov/planning/hearings/historic.asp</a>